



**Community Advisory Committee Meeting**

**Draft Minutes**

Monday, June 13, 2022

6:00pm

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84794506189>

Or join by phone:

Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):

US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799 or 877 853 5257 (Toll Free)

Webinar ID: 847 9450 6189

*Meetings are accessible to people with disabilities. Individuals who need special assistance or a disability-related modification or accommodation to participate in this meeting, or who have a disability and wish to request an alternative format for the meeting materials, should contact the Clerk of the Board at least 2 working days before the meeting at (510) 906-0491 or [cob@ebce.org](mailto:cob@ebce.org).*

*If you have anything that you wish to be distributed to the Committee, please email it to the clerk by 5:00 pm the day prior to the meeting.*

**C1. Welcome & Roll Call**

**Present:** Members: Franch, Hernandez, Lakshman, Landry, Liu, Lutz, Pacheco, Sutter, Swaminathan, and Chair Eldred

**Excused:** Members: Talreja and Vice-Chair Muetzenberg.

**Member Kaur served as an alternate for Vice-Chair Muetzenberg.**

**C2. Public Comment**

*This item is reserved for persons wishing to address the Committee on any EBCE-related matters that are not otherwise on this meeting agenda. Public comments on matters listed on the agenda shall be heard at the time the matter is called. As with all public comment, members of the public who wish to address the Committee are customarily limited to three minutes per*

*speaker and must complete an electronic [speaker slip](#). The Committee Chair may increase or decrease the time allotted to each speaker.*

**Irma Seabrook**, Director of Respiratory Care Services at UCSF Benioff Children's Hospital, spoke in support of the grant proposal for UCSF Children's Hospital's asthma program, stating that the grant would provide the resources to build an asthma center to better meet patients' needs, expand asthma education outreach, research drivers of asthma and pursue more advanced treatments.

**Dianne Martinez**, EBCE Board Chair, thanked CAC Member Mary Sutter for her leadership and service to the community.

**Tom Kelly** spoke in opposition to the grant proposal, stating that EBCE's money should be invested in reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

**Vaughn** stated that EBCE should study how microgrids fit into its Local Development Business Plan. Vaughn stated that the Climate Action Plans for Livermore and cities in the Tri-Valley includes planning for microgrids.

**Jessica Tovar**, on behalf of East Bay Clean Power Alliance and Local Clean Energy Alliance, stated that the environmental justice community seeks to transform communities into hubs that can develop strategies to provide clean energy, but that corporate power drives a wedge between these communities.

### **C3. Approval of Minutes from May 16, 2022**

**There were no speakers for public comment.**

**Member Sutter motioned to approve the minutes as amended. Member Hernandez seconded the motion which passed 9/0.**

**Excused: Member Talreja and Vice-Chair Muetzenberg.**

**Abstained: Members Franch and Pacheco.**

### **C4. CAC Chair Report**

- **Chair Eldred reported that Vice-Chair Muetzenberg attended the EBCE Board meeting of May 18<sup>th</sup> and reported that:**
  - **The Board of Directors adopted a support position for AB 2765, but did not answer why members were in support of the bill. The motion to approve AB 2765 passed without objection.**
  - **Vice-Chair Muetzenberg communicated to the Board that the Community Innovation Grants were a priority for the CAC and**

that he believed there may be some opportunity for the CAC to engage more deeply in that work.

- Chair Eldred announced Member Mary Sutter's last meeting and expressed appreciation for her work on behalf of the CAC.
- Chair Eldred announced that she will agendaize a discussion of the the power content label at a future meeting.
- Chair Eldred reported that Member Lorraine Souza would be joining the CAC as a full-time member to replace Member Sutter.

Tom Kelly spoke in support of creating an agenda item to discuss the power content label but stated that pushing the discussion to a future meeting reinforced his belief that EBCE staff are unresponsive to the concerns of the public.

#### **C5. Metrics Review (CAC Informational Item)**

LDBP Projects and portfolio balance update

Tom Kelly requested a list of EBCE's achievements in relation to the recommendations listed in its Local Development Business plan.

Jessica Tovar, on behalf of East Bay Clean Power Alliance, spoke in support of funding electrification and energy efficiency projects in cities that don't qualify for state and federal funding. Jessica Tovar stated the East Bay Clean Power Alliance could help EBCE to connect with local community choice organizations.

#### **C6. Board and CAC Stipends (CAC Action Item)**

Board and CAC Stipends review

##### **The Committee Discussed:**

- The role of stipends as a guarantee the ability of members to to participate in CAC meetings on an ongoing basis.
- CAC/BOD stipend parity
- CAC member workload

Jessica Tovar, on behalf of East Bay Clean Power Alliance, spoke in support of bringing CAC stipends to parity with the Board. Jessica Tovar noted the impact of inflation and stated that the success of EBCE is tied to the participation of members of the community.

**Member Landry motioned that consideration be brought forth to give CAC members the same stipend as Board members.**

**Chair Eldred requested the motion be amended to the CAC stipend is increased to \$100 with a request that staff and the Board consider achieving stipend parity between the CAC and Board.**

**The maker of the motion accepted the amendment to the motion.**

**Member Hernandez seconded the motion.**

**The maker of the motion amended the motion to state that CAC stipends should be brought up to parity with the Board.**

**The seconder of the motion accepted the amendment to the motion.**

**The motion passed 10/0. Excused: Member Talreja and Vice-Chair Muetzenberg. Abstained: Member Lui.**

#### **C7. FY 2022-2023 (CAC Action Item)**

Staff will describe the FY 2022-2023 budget

**Van Rainy** spoke in opposition to the grant proposal for UCSF Benioff Children's Hospital. Van Rainy stated that a public forum should be organized to on the most beneficial ways to use the grant money. Van Rainy said the many causes worthy of the grant money should be discussed, rather than a simple yes or no to the Children's Hospital grant.

**Amos White**, 100K Trees for Humanity, stated that his East Bay urban reforestation nonprofit submitted a request that EBCE allocate 9% of its budget surplus to his program. Amos White stated that his 100K Trees proposal aims to plant trees at scale in three frontline East Bay communities. Amos White requested that EBCE slow down the grant making process so that the public has greater input into how these funds are allocated.

**Tom Kelly** questioned the value of public input, stating that the comments received for this item suggest that the majority of people support a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions. Tom Kelly provided a list of suggestions of actions that EBCE could take to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

**Jessica Tovar**, on behalf of East Bay Clean Power Alliance, provided of list of alternative funding opportunities for the \$15 million grant proposal. Jessica Tovar also noted that in 2019 UCSF had \$2.3 billion in assets and in 2021 received \$569 million in donations, but that poor people in disadvantaged communities do not have access to resources to access clean energy programs.

**The Committee Discussed:**

- Proposed \$15 million Benioff Children's Hospital grant
- Examining the ongoing maintenance and water expense for the proposed tree planting proposal, as well as 100K Trees' savings claims.

**Member Pacheco motioned that the CAC support the \$15 million environmental/public health grant, but that the award of the grant be moved back two months so that there is an opportunity for a public and transparent selection process for that grant amount. Member Landry seconded the motion.**

**The motion passed 11/0. Excused: Member Talreja and Vice-Chair Muetzenberg.**

**The Committee Discussed:**

- The possibility of parity with PG&E for residential and small commercial Renewable 100 accounts and evaluating that as an option to the budget, seeing how it impacts the budget, and an option the Board would consider, excluding the grant.
- The priorities for the CAC and the public for the rest of the budget, excluding the grant:
  - Improvements in local, renewable energy content.
  - Greenhouse gas emissions reductions in the Bright Choice offering.
  - Better rates and prices for customers.
  - Parity with PG&E for residential and small commercial Renewable 100 accounts.

**Member Hernandez motioned that the CAC recommend budget approval with value proposition updates, that EBCE seek to reduce costs to its customers, that EBCE would increase its product mix to less unidentified sources of power and include additional clean and renewable sources for the portfolio, and that EBCE would recommend that the residential and small commercial accounts for Renewable 100 be on par with PG&E. Director Landry seconded the motion, which passed 11/0. Excused: Member Talreja and Vice-Chair Muetzenberg.**

**C8. CAC Member and Staff Announcements including requests to place items on future CAC agendas**

**Chair Eldred announced that Reverend Chambers would be undergoing kidney transplant surgery on June 23<sup>rd</sup> and that Board Clerk Bankhead would be circulate an e-card for signatures.**

**Member Sutter provided comments and was thanked by staff and members of the public for her many contributions to the CAC.**

**Chair Eldred also welcomed new CAC Member Souza who will begin her service at the next meeting.**

**C9. Adjournment to Monday, July 18, 2022 at 6:00pm**