



Draft Minutes

Community Advisory Committee Meeting

Monday, June 10, 2024

6:00 pm

In Person:

The Lake Merritt Room
Cal State East Bay - the Oakland Center
In the Transpacific Centre
1000 Broadway, Suite 109
Oakland, CA 94607

Or from the following remote locations:

Member Stephenson – 1343 Fairview Ct, Livermore CA 94550
Member Swaminathan – 4563 Meyer Park Circle, Fremont, CA 94536
Member Lakshman – 4664 Rousillon Ave, Fremont, CA 94555
Member Kaur – Starbucks at 1857 11th St. Tracy, CA 95376

Via Zoom:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84794506189>

Or join by phone:

Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):
US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 929
205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799 or 877 853 5257 (Toll Free)
Webinar ID: 847 9450 6189

Meetings are accessible to people with disabilities. Individuals who need special assistance or a disability-related modification or accommodation to participate in this meeting, or who have a disability and wish to request an alternative format for the meeting materials, should contact the Clerk of the Board at least 2 working days before the meeting at (510) 906-0491 or cob@avaenergy.org.

If you have anything that you wish to be distributed to the Committee, please email it to the clerk by 5:00 pm the day prior to the meeting.

(2:51) Rachel DiFranco was sworn in as the Alternate Member the Central Region.

C1. Welcome & Roll Call

Present: Members: Landry, Weiner, Stephenson, Swaminathan, Lakshman, DiFranco, Kaur, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

Not Present: Members: Hu, Balkissoon, Lakshman, Harper and Pacheco

Member Weiner served as the alternate for Member Hu (North).

Member DiFranco served as the alternate for Member Pacheco (San Joaquin County).

Member Lakshman joined the meeting at 6:49pm.

Member Weiner left the meeting at 8:34pm.

C2. Public Comment

This item is reserved for persons wishing to address the Committee on any Ava Community Energy-related matters that are not otherwise on this meeting agenda. Public comments on matters listed on the agenda shall be heard at the time the matter is called. As with all public comment, members of the public who wish to address the Committee are customarily limited to three minutes per speaker and must complete an electronic [speaker slip](#). The Committee Chair may increase or decrease the time allotted to each speaker.

(4:25) Public Comment – Brenden Pittman spoke in opposition to the CAC's recommendation to reject nuclear energy allocation, arguing it supports unspecified and dirtier power sources like coal and natural gas.

(7:50) Public Comment – Ryan Pickering, a solar installer in Berkeley, stated that although he initially opposed the Diablo Canyon Nuclear Facility and nuclear energy, his views have evolved as he learned more about balancing the energy grid. He also mentioned that there is a petition in Berkeley to amend the nuclear-free zone, which could allow for peaceful nuclear sciences, including energy.

(10:57) Public Comment – Timothy Smith stated that SB100 does include nuclear power as an acceptable zero-carbon energy source, supported by a 2018 letter from the bill's sponsor, Kevin de Leon. He also addressed the issue of the Diablo Canyon plant being on stolen indigenous land, noting that the Yak Tityu Tityu Yak Tilhini (YTT) nation is in negotiations with PG&E and is not opposed to the plant's operation. Timothy Smith stated that continuing the plant's operation could benefit the YTT nation by providing financial leverage for their ancestral rights.

(14:12) Public Comment – Aya Peters-Paz, representing the Local Clean Energy Alliance, stated that she had updated the Board on the CAC's discussion about the need for more comprehensive funding for resilience hubs. Peters-Paz mentioned that the board has requested a study session on resilience hubs, and spoke about the importance of including community groups and voices in this

study session.

(17:08) Public Comment – Jessica Tovar thanked the CAC for voting against accepting the nuclear allocation. Jessica Tovar stated that making a rushed decision without full disclosure of the impact on Ava Community Energy rate payers would be negligent.

(20:23) Public Comment – Tom Kelly stated that one of the main reasons people were excited about forming East Bay Community Energy was to avoid using nuclear power. He also noted that accepting nuclear energy would hinder progress toward renewable and carbon-free energy.

C3. Approval of Minutes from May 13, 2024

(24:01) Public Comment – Regarding the May 13, 2024 CAC meeting, Item 9 PG&E nuclear allocation, **Brenden Pittman** requested that the minutes include a summary of the discussion about unspecified energy.

(26:36) Member Lutz motioned to approve the minutes with an inclusion of the discussion about unspecified power as recommended by Brenden Pittman, and the inclusion of the comment that the discussion about unspecified energy included natural gas in the unspecified allocation, as recommended by Member Landry. Member Landry seconded the motion, which was approved 8/0/1/0/3:

Yes: Members: Landry, Weiner, Stephenson, Swaminathan, Kaur, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

No: none

Abstain: Member DiFranco

Recuse: none

Not Present: Members Balkissoon, Lakshman and Harper

C4. CAC Chair Report

(27:19) Chair Hernandez provided a brief update about the May 29, 2024 Power Resources Special Board Retreat¹. **Vice-Chair Souza** provided an update of the June 12, 2024 BOD meeting, and stated that members of the public spoke about the need for more support for low-income individuals, expanding resilience hubs, and leakage reports from power plants. **Member Landry** spoke regarding discussions at the May 29 BOD meetings about potentially partnering with community-based organizations to provide assistance to rate-payers who are behind on their PG&E bills.

C5. 2024-2025 Budget (Board Action Item)

Consider approval the fiscal year budget for 2024-2025

¹ The recording for this meeting is available at <https://avaenergy.org/meetings/special-board-retreat-power-resources-5-29-24/>

(34:35) Howard Chang presented the 2024-2025 budget. Howard spoke regarding significant changes since May, 2024 due to PG&E's Energy Resource Recovery Account (ERRA) forecast, which predicted lower energy rates and higher Power Charge Indifference Adjustment (PCIA) charges. These changes led to a reduction in Ava's projected revenues, resulting in a proposed budget surplus decrease from \$139 million to \$42 million. To address the budget constraints, Howard recommended maintaining the value proposition at a 5% discount to PG&E rates, eliminating the \$50 Care/Fera bill credit, and adjusting the allocation of surplus funds to prioritize reserve funds and targeted bill credits.

(49:30) Member Lakshman joined the meeting.

(1:16:00) Public Comment – Tom Kelly stated there is no funding allocated for new renewables and carbon-free projects and added that achieving a credit rating does not save money but attracts investors. Mr. Kelly warned that accepting nuclear allocations could delay purchasing other carbon-free projects. He also recommended reviewing the Padilla report² to ensure Ava is negotiating the best deals for solar and wind projects.

(1:19:12) Public Comment – Brenden Pittman asked how Ava's price forecasts are correlated with natural gas prices, and if there is information available to the public on this topic. He also asked how the budget accounts for natural gas price volatility.

(1:20:16) Public Comment – Jessica Tovar spoke in support of staff efforts to provide solar and storage incentives but highlighted the need for more long-term integration of community-based innovation and local clean energy jobs.

(1:23:07) Chair Hernandez motioned to adjust the allocation of net revenues for the upcoming budget cycle with a community-first approach.

Chair Hernandez's motion proposed the following:

1. Allocate \$3.3 million for CARE/FERA on-bill credits first.
2. Allocate \$25 million for solar and storage incentives next.
3. Allocate the remaining funds to reserves, up to \$50 million.
4. Any additional surplus beyond these allocations should be used for further community investments, such as community innovation grants.

² The Padilla Report is available at <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/-/media/cpuc-website/divisions/office-of-governmental-affairs-division/reports/2024/2024-padilla-reportvfinal.pdf>

(1:33:24) Member Landry seconded Chair Hernandez's motion.

(1:41:17) Member Swaminathan proposed an amendment to Chair Hernandez's motion:

Member Swaminathan's amended motion proposed the following:

1. Keep Chair Hernandez's waterfall order.
2. Allocate \$30 million to reserves instead of \$50 million.
3. Allocate any additional surplus to local development programs with a focus on equity, up to \$20 million.
4. Any remaining funds after these allocations should go to reserves.

(1:49:58) Member DiFranco proposed a substitute motion that aimed to adjust the allocation of net revenues:

Member DiFranco's substitute motion proposed the following:

- 1. Keep Chair Hernandez's waterfall order.**
- 2. Reduce the reserve allocation from \$50 million to \$30 million.**
- 3. Allocate \$3.3 million for CARE/FERA on-bill credits.**
- 4. Allocate up to an additional \$25 million for the 60/40 split between on-bill credits and the solar and storage incentive program.**
- 5. Allocate up to \$20 million towards local development programs with a focus on equity.**
- 6. Direct any remaining funds after these allocations to the reserves.**

Member Landry seconded Member DiFranco's substitute motion, which was approved 9/0/1/0/2

Yes: Members: Landry, Weiner, Swaminathan, Lakshman, DiFranco, Kaur, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

No: none

Abstain: Member Stephenson

Recuse: none

Not Present: Members Balkissoon and Harper

C6. Long-Term Offtake Agreements (Board Action Item)

Consider approval and execution of the purchased power agreement for Rosemary Solar+Storage Contract and Aypa Storage Contract

(2:09:53) Scott Harding, Director of Origination for the Power Resources Department, presented two 20-year agreements for approval resulting from the 2023 long-term resource request for offers. The first project is a 70 megawatt solar facility with 70 megawatts of storage located in Fresno County, set to be

operational by June 1, 2028. This project was developed by Longroad Development Company. The second project is a standalone storage facility of 100 megawatts for four hours in Los Angeles County, expected to be operational by June 1, 2027. This project is developed by Aypa Power Development. Both projects aim to ensure that Ava Community Energy meets resource adequacy and renewable portfolio standards at cost-effective rates.

(2:34:44) Member Weiner *recused himself from the vote and left the meeting.*

(2:36:46) Vice-Chair Souza motioned to approve the staff recommendation.

Member Lutz seconded the motion, which passed 9/0/0/1/4:

Yes: Members: Landry, Stephenson, Swaminathan, Lakshman, DiFranco, Kaur, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

No: none

Abstain: none

Recused: Member Weiner

Not Present: Members Balkissoon and Harper

C7. Managed Charging Program Scope under DERMS Contract (Board Consent Item)

Action item to include a managed EV charging services scope under the existing authorization for the CEO to negotiate and execute Lunar Energy DERMS contract

(2:38:02) Brett Wiley, Senior Program Associate for Ava's Electric Mobility programs, presented an overview of the Managed Charging Program, which aims to optimize electric vehicle (EV) charging to reduce costs and emissions, in partnership with Optiwatt. The program, stemming from Ava's Distributed Energy Resource Management Systems (DERMS), demonstrated significant success in shifting EV charging away from peak hours during a pilot, and now seeks to enroll up to 10,000 EVs in the first two years. The initiative, supported by a \$2.3 million budget, focuses on load management, customer savings, and reduced greenhouse gas emissions, while ensuring data security and customer privacy.

(3:22:30) Member Lutz motioned to approve the staff recommendation.

Member DiFranco seconded the motion, which passed 8/0/0/0/4:

Yes: Members: Landry, Stephenson, Swaminathan, Lakshman, DiFranco, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

No: none

Abstain: none

Recuse: none

Not Present: Members Balkissoon, Weiner, Kaur and Harper

C8. Additional Funding to The Energy Council (“Stopwaste”) to Administer the Bay Area Regional Heat Pump Water Heater Contractor Incentive Program (Board Consent Item)

Add funding to existing Heat pump water heater program

(3:23:49) Dan Bertoldi, Ava's Electrification Program Manager, recommended the board approve an additional \$1 million funding for the Bay Area Regional Heat Pump Water Heater Contractor Incentive Program administered by Stopwaste. This additional funding will support the installation of approximately 880 heat pump water heaters, doubling the 550 units already installed under the program. The state's TECH program is currently paused, making this funding crucial until the next phase is approved, and future steps will focus on addressing incentives for income-qualified customers.

(3:33:26) Member Landry motioned to approve the staff recommendation.

Member Lutz seconded the motion, which passed 9/0/0/0/3:

Yes: Members: Landry, Stephenson, Swaminathan, Lakshman, DiFranco, Kaur, Lutz, Vice-Chair Souza and Chair Hernandez

No: none

Abstain: none

Recuse: none

Not Present: Members Balkissoon, Weiner and Harper

C9. CAC Member and Staff Announcements including requests to place items on future CAC agendas

(3:34:44) Member Lutz proposed holding CAC workshops and study sessions on the first Monday of each month to gather information on topics like community resilience hubs and net billing tariffs, with support from Ava staff.

(3:37:13) Vice-Chair Souza and **Member DiFranco** supported Member Lutz's proposal but suggested that it could be done less frequently and possibly through community meetings, organized in coordination with the board and staff, to avoid overburdening members with meetings.

C10. Adjourned at 9:45pm

The next Community Advisory Committee meeting will be held on Monday, July 15, 2024 at 6:00 pm.

The Lake Merritt Room
Cal State East Bay - the Oakland Center
In the Transpacific Centre
1000 Broadway, Suite 109
Oakland, CA 94607