

Last updated: 12/5/2022

Question	Program	Date	Response
1 Do we need to win the RFP to participate?	EE/Grid Services	28-Oct	We are open to program designs that either limit installation contractors / participants to those directly managed by the Bidder, or to broader approaches that allow participation from multiple providers.
2 Will there be more than one participant?	EE/Grid Services	28-Oct	This depends on the program design proposed by the winning bidder.
3 How is the ~\$100/MWh compensated in years 2 through X?	Grid Services	28-Oct	EBCE is envisioning that we contract for 5 years to pay for measured savings as they are delivered over the 5 year time frame.
4 Can you talk more about your expectations for integration with the MAP and BayRen programs?	EE/Grid Services	1-Nov	As these are all ratepayer funded programs, there will be no integration with these programs. We are working on a Joint Cooperation Memorandum (JCM) with BayREN and PG&E that will include our approach for aligning on marketing to avoid customer confusion as well as our protocol for avoiding, evaluating and addressing double dipping. The document will also include a Program Referral Tree which will help Program Managers guide customers to relevant programs. Our JCM is due to the CPUC on December 14th, and the selected implementer will be subject to its direction.
5 How will you post the attendees for partnering?	EE/Grid Services	1-Nov	We will reach out to attendees for permission before publically posting their contact information to our website at https://ebce.org/solicitations/ by COB Monday.
6 Will the MAP / BayRen programs be competing for the same customers, or will there be some division of customer segments?	EE/Grid Services	1-Nov	We are still working out details of the JCM (see response #4), but generally, the first program that a customer comes in contact with is the program that will serve that customer. With that said, there will be overlap with customer segments. If a customer is not an EBCE customer or if a customer is pursuing gas measures, we will provide warm hand-offs to other relevant programs.
7 Can you explain more about savings verified at the meter? E.g., Will NMEC customer segments will be used for baselining savings?	EE/Grid Services	1-Nov	We are looking to the Bidder to identify which NMEC methodology they will use and how they will apply it to each of the programs. While our pilot program utilized population-level NMEC, we are open to whatever CPUC-approved methodology the Bidder proposes.
8 Will this webinar be posted on the website, also?	EE/Grid Services	1-Nov	Webinar recordings will be posted on https://ebce.org/solicitations/ .
9 Please further define what 'NMEC' means as the CPUC has two categories of NMEC: site-level and population based.	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	We are open to the Bidder proposing which methodology they plan to use.
10 What coordination will the implementer need to make with the evaluator? Or will the implementer only provide M&V reporting to EBCE and EBCE will conduct all interactions with the evaluator?	EE	10-Nov	We have recommended that the Bidder articulate the M&V approach they would like to take. We are also encouraging bidders to team as necessary to address all components of the SOW.
11 Is there a floor or cap on what capacities you are seeking for Additional Grid services?	Grid Services	10-Nov	We are open to receiving all bids - please propose what you think you can procure.
12 What are your expectations for when the customer would be paid the incentive and when the implementer would receive the P4P payment?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	We are open to the bidder proposing the measurement and settlement schedule.
13 How will the 60% demand control strategies and 30% building electrification goals be applied in the contract? What kind of enforcement or compensation mechanism do you anticipate in the contract, if any?	EE	10-Nov	While we have not considered enforcement or compensation mechanisms regarding these targets, we are interested in seeing performance based contracts.
14 For the additional grid services: - how do resources get dispatched during the morning peak or evening peak? - is there an option for a capacity style model (ie \$/MW as opposed to \$/MWh)? To compensate participants for their availability regardless of how many times they are dispatched?	Grid Services	10-Nov	For additional grid services, EBCE is providing a price signal and is interested in how the market will respond. In this case, it is up to the Bidder to articulate strategy for both of the bulleted questions. In terms of compensating participants, if you choose to distribute the price signal to participants multiple times whether or not you dispatch that resource, the strategy is ultimately up to the implementer.
15 What would be your preference - high TRCs with lower volumes of participation OR a high customer participation and just meeting the threshold TRC?	EE	10-Nov	The TRC is a 'must need' threshold. Beyond the TRC, other program outcomes become the driving factors (e.g. are we able to achieve peak reduction? are we achieving electrification goals, etc.) These outcomes are more important to us rather than the mix of customer participation relative to the TRC.
16 How will the proposal scoring account for building electrification and demand control?	EE	10-Nov	We will be leveraging the Technical Evaluation Criteria found in the solicitation to evaluate each proposal.
17 Do you use the CET calculator for determining TRC? Are there any adjustments to be made for avoided costs given you may have a different procurement structure than CA utilities?	EE	10-Nov	Yes. As a program administered under the auspices of the CPUC, we are required to use CPUC methodology. As the CPUC adjusts the framework over the years, the adjustments will also be applied towards evaluating our program accomplishments. There is no adjustment for us as a unique program administrator.
18 Does EBCE have a streamlined process for obtaining customer energy data from PG&E? What requirements are there to obtain participant data as well as non-participant data (for control group purposes)?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	Please reference Attachment D in the solicitation where we describe the variety of data feeds we receive from PG&E. Of these feeds, we receive gas and electric data which will be available to the implementer. For participant vs. non-participant data, this something to be handled via NDA. Third-party implementers must demonstrate that they can comply with CPUC policies for management of personally identifiable information and other protected data.
19 Can the program incentivize and take credit for forklifts that fuel switch from propane to electric?	EE	10-Nov	Propane is a non-regulated fuel under the CPUC so this is not a category that we would be able to provide incentives for.
20 Can the implementer use EBCE's CRM and BigQuery systems to develop program reporting and analytics, or do you expect the implementer to provide its own database for reporting and analytics?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	EBCE is expecting to leverage our existing database for reporting and analytics. Bidders may leverage any of the data tools described in the solicitation and Attachment D. For reporting, we are looking to build our own interface so the implementer can input information in our database when invoicing on a monthly/quarterly cadence. EBCE will ultimately be responsible for reporting up to the CPUC.
21 Are there any reports on the results and conclusions from the EBCE P4P pilot programs?	EE	10-Nov	We do not have any public reports on EBCE's Commercial P4P Pilot Program. As we approach the one year measurement period for this pilot (projects were enrolled in December of 2021), we only have forecasted program results. Based on the three enrolled projects, the forecasted average kWh savings is 177,048.
22 For additional grid services do the morning and evening peak hours apply seven days per week? or only weekdays?	Grid Services	10-Nov	Seven days per week.
23 Given your past/ongoing Commercial program was a success are you looking for a similar program design?	EE	10-Nov	We are open to reviewing to whatever bidders think will be successful in this space.
24 Section 4.2 states that ECBE will pay incentives for savings verified at the meter. Does this mean 1.) That the ECBE and not the IC is paying the incentive? 2.) That customers must front 100% of money upfront and will only be reimbursed after the savings have been verified?	EE	10-Nov	We are open to any program design. If Bidder proposes that EBCE is in the role of settling and paying incentives or if Bidder proposes that they receive a set of payments and manage the settlement and processing, either way is acceptable. Given that we have TRC and savings goals to meet, we are interested in an approach that balances our (EBCE) and the contractor's risk exposure as well as ensuring that the programs is attractive to customers.
25 Does the M&V need to follow CA statewide NMEC rulebook?	EE	10-Nov	Yes.
26 Will you provide a list of attendees and emails to these bidder conferences?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	See response to question #5.
27 What is your target for diverse suppliers and how will that affect the scoring?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	EBCE has an Administrative Procurement Policy which states the preference for certain categories of suppliers. We have established 10% of the total score for Bidders who can achieve this. This may be fulfilled by subcontracting, partnering with local organizations, or a narrative approach for how you plan to achieve this.
28 Can residential resources be included for the additional grid services?	Grid Services	10-Nov	Yes.
29 Will inclusion of electrification measures impact TRC negatively from (a) energy usage stand point and/or (b) program cost	EE	10-Nov	It may. The TRC target is our primary objective so this our first priority. However, we are interested in hearing from Bidders any kind of strategies they have for ensuring that there's a space for electrification in this program.
30 You mentioned possibly sharing slide decks on forecast results from the pilots. Can you share that as part of the formal responses to Q&A, or in some other format? It would be helpful to get information on those pilot designs and expected results.	EE	10-Nov	See response to question #21.
31 The reference to Commercial means all Non-Residential, is that correct?	EE	10-Nov	Yes.
32 Does your scoring rubric give advantage for existing implementers?	EE	10-Nov	Our scoring rubric does not give an advantage for existing implementers; however, there is a qualifications section of our rubric which looks at Bidders' experience in successfully serving non-residential customers.
33 Are bidders required to suggest a performance based budget?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	No. While there is a preference for performance based budgets within the evaluation criteria, this is not a requirement.
34 Have PG&E account reps helped market EBCE programs?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	This will be our first effort running an energy efficiency program at scale, so we do not have a history of engagement with PG&E in this space; however, we are currently developing a Joint Cooperation Memorandum (JCM) with PG&E and BayREN to ensure there is a clear understanding of program design and a directory of contacts to support customer referrals between programs.
35 Do you have expectations on how the customers will be divided at the middle size segment, between BayRen and the EBCE program? Do you prefer competition over customers or dividing up responsibility?	EE	10-Nov	We are currently working this out in real-time with BayREN. Our approach for managing overlap in this program area is that the first program to interact with that customer and procure an application will be served by the program unless the program is unable to serve that customer.
36 Do you have any data that you can share on under-served / under-participating segments within Non-Res?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	The best source of data may live in the CPUC EM&V reports.

37	Can you talk a little bit about how contractor management by implementers is being envisioned?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	We are open to whatever approaches the Bidder proposes. This could look like a trade ally network or a team of in-house contractors that work for a firm. We are flexible on approach, but we do want to see that the Bidder has a clear quality assurance/quality control strategy.
38	Should the TRC be met each year	EE	10-Nov	The TRC requirement will be for the full program implementation time frame, and we will be seeking metrics to check that the TRC requirements are on track. Through the CPUC quarterly reporting process, we will be able to verify whether the savings claims we submit are achieving TRC targets. This is something we will likely be looking at on a quarterly basis beginning in 2024.
39	Do you have TSB goals for this	EE	10-Nov	No. This is not a requirement for elect-to-administer (ETA) CCAs.
40	In the RFP section 11. REQUIRED DOCUMENTATION AND SUBMITTALS, there are no page limits given for section 3. Key Personnel or section 6. Costs. Although it says resumes can be attached and are not counted towards the page limit for section 3, can EBCE please specify if there are page limits for these two individual sections in the proposal narrative?	EE/Grid Services	10-Nov	There are no page limits for Key Personnel or Costs sections.
41	Regarding pricing for a proposal, can you please confirm whether bidder compensation should be assumed as included in the energy peak rates defined in section 5.2? Or would our pricing be tied to a Consulting Services Agreement and SOW? Is EBCE looking to contract a services agreement for us to implement and manage load flexibility programs, and the energy rates are purely for customer incentives, OR is the intent for us to provide turnkey grid services and use the published energy rates to cover all customer incentives, partner costs, and our pricing?	Grid Services	15-Nov	The \$/MWh price signal is inclusive of all admin, customer acquisition, and incentive costs.
42	It appears that in many cases the RFP peak energy rates are lower than the peak energy rates published on the EBCE website (https://res.cloudinary.com/diactiwnk7/image/upload/v1666198350/2022_October_1_Rate_Sheet_2019_Vint_age_ewftkm.pdf). So how would the rates for additional grid services serve as an incentive for such a customer?	Grid Services	15-Nov	Correct. The link provided is to our retail rates. We are using our wholesale costs, which are below retail rates. Customer savings will be associated with the retail rates. The EBCE payments will be additional to customer savings.
43	Would the distributed energy resources that are providing the additional grid services also be able to participate in any other grid programs? Perhaps capacity programs such as DRAM? Or ELRP?	Grid Services	15-Nov	Distributed energy resources that are providing the additional grid services should not participate in other grid programs for the same resources (i.e. the same value for the same resources should not be captured by two programs). However, the additional grid services may be stacked with an EE program where resources are used to procure additional value.
44	How would EBCE propose to measure the performance of DERs, especially batteries and EVSE? Would we be able to use telemetry directly from the device for M&V?	Grid Services	15-Nov	We are open to any M&V strategies proposed by Bidders.
45	In the RFP section 4.2.1, it is stated: "To support implementation of the program, EBCE can provide customer targeting via internal data and analytics platform, marketing, regulatory and compliance filing submissions (though support will be needed), Salesforce CRM and partner portal, EBCE customer verification, and EBCE call center support. EBCE prefers to host a project intake form on the EBCE program website and leverage EBCE's Salesforce CRM for limited lead tracking, incentive reservations, and final project reporting." Question: If a bidder requests EBCE support or services to support their design (i.e., analytics, incentive processing, marketing), how should the bidder account for those costs against the RFP NTE budget?	EE	17-Nov	Bidders should articulate the extent to which they hope to leverage EBCE services in their budget justification narrative, and propose a budget table without these costs.
46	So for Additional Grid Services the expectation is that we would execute a Consulting Services Agreement but work would NOT be on a time and materials basis (as per the template agreement)? Or are you expecting certain implementation and M&V services to be priced based on T&M and then the remainder of the ongoing program admin to be funded through the \$/MWh price signal?	Grid Services	18-Nov	The former is correct.
47	If, for example, a residential BTM battery discharges during the evening peak time, the site owner would receive both the retail rate benefit as well as the peak incentive listed in the RFP? Would net export to the grid be allowed?	Grid Services	18-Nov	Potentially. It is up to the Bidder to determine how to allocate the incentive. Net export is allowed and will be compensated at the same rate.
48	In the case of a smart thermostat program, if we assume a max annual dispatch of 50 peak summer hours, this would equate to <\$6/kw/year, which will not be sufficient to incentivize participation. Are we thinking about this correctly, or missing anything?	Grid Services	18-Nov	The actual value would depend on the avoided energy use during this period. Please note that we are not restricting our payment to only summer peak as we are offering price signals for year-round peak.
49	Does EBCE have account reps that can connect us with your large customers?	EE	18-Nov	EBCE can assist the implementer with outreach to customers.
50	What does EBCE consider "high opportunity" projects? On page 4 of the RFP, it indicates EBCE is targeting 50% of projects will include "high opportunity" projects as identified by EBCE. Could you provide more guidance on what those projects might be?	EE	18-Nov	High opportunity meaning customers with high peak usage and / or high usage overall.
51	We're considering a proposal design that doesn't include a trade ally network model, which would give participants the chance to use their contractor of choice. In that model, we wouldn't fulfill a QA/QC role for measure installation beyond commissioning the project to assess energy savings/savings M&V. Would EBCE be open to a model like that?	EE	18-Nov	It is up to the Bidder to specify what their approach is to ensuring quality installation; however, minimum requirement is that permits are pulled.
52	If we were to do peak kW reductions in the energy efficiency program, would we get paid from additional grid services budget, or do we need to make sure that any peak load reduction work is budgeted within the energy efficiency program budget?	EE	1-Dec	Peak reductions associated with energy efficiency improvements would be considered part of the EE program; additional peak reductions above and beyond what is expected from the EE program can be attributed to the Additional Grid Services program and qualify for an incentive. However, if proposing a response to the Additional Grid Services program, the Bidder should propose a firm methodology for measuring those additional benefits.
53	Does EBCE intend to enroll projects for up to 3 years (or until budget is expended), or enroll projects for up to	EE	2-Dec	EBCE intends to enroll projects up to 3 years, with final M&V occurring in the fourth year.
54	The CPUC Resolution E-5215 states a budget of \$13.463M and EBCE's RFP documentation states an NTE of \$11	EE	2-Dec	A portion of the overall budget is withheld for EBCE staff time on this program (including customer support, data & analytics, and marketing). Additionally, a portion of the budget is dedicated to EM&V efforts.
55	Section 5.2: How were the \$/MWh prices in the table derived?	Grid Services	2-Dec	The \$/MWh prices in the table are calculated based on our hourly forecasted cost to serve.
56	What is EBCE's interest in financing VPP development through upfront payments to VPP aggregators?	Grid Services	2-Dec	We are open to any program design proposed by Bidders that adhere to the Grid Services payment values provided in the RFP. EBCE has limited appetite for payments that are not tied to delivered values.
57	Is EBCE's intent to hold contracts with demand reduction providers that sign up for participation in the program	Grid Services	2-Dec	Potentially, depending on the proposed program design. It is up to the Bidder to determine how the incentive is allocated.
58	How will EBCE evaluate site-level custom M&V vs. standardized, open-source NMEC that enables market integr	EE/Grid Services	2-Dec	We are open to any CPUC-approved methodology for M&V and we will evaluate alongside the corresponding program design.